

PERSONNEL/ADMINISTRATIVE AFFAIRS COMMITTEE

JANUARY 3, 2023

A meeting of the Personnel/Administrative Affairs Committee was held Tuesday, January 3, 2023, at 7:00 p.m. in the Aldermanic Chamber.

The roll call was taken with 4 members of the Personnel/Administrative Affairs Committee present:

Chairwoman Shoshanna Kelly presided.

Members of the Committee present: Alderwoman-at-Large Shoshanna Kelly, Chairwoman  
Alderman-at-Large Ben Clemons, Vice Chair  
Alderman Thomas Lopez  
Alderman Derek Thibeault

Members not in Attendance: Alderman Tyler Gouveia

Also in Attendance: Alderman-at-Large Melbourne Moran, Jr.  
Alderman Patricia Klee  
Mayor Jim Donchess

---

ROLL CALL

PUBLIC COMMENT - None

COMMUNICATIONS - None

INTERVIEWS

Housing Trust Fund Committee

William Dolan (new appointment)  
71 Spit Brook Road, Unit 109  
Nashua, NH 03060

Term to Expire: January 1, 2026

Chairwoman Kelly

Getting settled, this note said our second appoint here to the Board of Assessors is unable to make it this evening and will be joining us at our February meeting. Okay.

Mayor Donchess

Thank you, Madam Chair. I am coming before you to present the nomination of Bill Dolan, William Dolan, for the Housing Trust Fund Committee. Now you'll recall that we created the Housing Trust Fund Committee to help advise the City regarding the procedures and rules for the Housing Trust Fund which is basically an affordable housing trust fund to which you as the Board of Aldermen have voted to devote \$10 million the vast majority of the ARPA or federal money that we recently have received.

The legislation that created the Housing Trust Fund Committee requires that we appoint an attorney. One lawyer that we did nominate and who you approved was Andy Prolman but he had to step aside because his partner Gerry Prunier unfortunately passed away. He is left with more than he can handle at work and therefore he had to withdraw. Attorney Dolan had expressed interest in this. He was recently elected as a State Rep. here in Nashua. Very interested in community service. He is a practicing attorney who went to Suffolk University School of Law. Also has a Master's in Business Administration from Suffolk and of course a BA where he graduated summa cum laude, in other words the highest honors. He is fluent in other languages like Spanish. Obviously is very interested in affordable housing and trying to ensure that our community meets that very pressing critical need. So I will introduce Bill Dolan and ask him to say a few words about himself regarding his interest in serving on the Housing Trust Fund Committee.

Chairwoman Kelly

Thank you, Mayor Donchess. Attorney Dolan?

Attorney William Dolan

Thank you everyone for the opportunity to speak. I'm a resident of Nashua. I'm a practicing attorney. I believe that civic commitments and civic service are important for people that live in the community to give back. I believe that my skills as an attorney gives me an opportunity that maybe others don't have to be of service to the community of people who live here. I am excited to get involved with the Housing Trust Fund Committee and being able to create a plan to help Nashua move forward with new City housing.

Chairwoman Kelly

Okay. I'll open it up to Committee. Just so you know, these are very directional so you can get a little closer and pull it towards you then everybody at home can hear you a little better. Alderman Lopez?

Alderman Lopez

So with regards to the way that the ARPA funding is used and the Housing Trust Fund was configured, it is an effort in addition to promoting economic development to provide a semblance of housing equity in Nashua. Do you have any experience with people from diverse housing backgrounds and with diverse housing needs?

Attorney William Dolan

Yes. Actually as a young man I grew up in public housing. I think that's another unique thing about myself as someone who lived in the housing projects. I think in terms of housing, that's pretty diverse. I'm not sure anybody else on that Board has an experience. I'd rather have applicants have had that same experience.

Alderman Lopez

Thank you for that answer.

Chairwoman Kelly

Other questions from the Committee? Alderman Clemons?

Alderman Clemons

Thank you. Thank you for coming forward. My only question is what your experience has been or do you have any experience in real estate law at all?

Attorney William Dolan

So are you asking me – so just to be clear, in terms of real estate law or housing law because they're actually two distinct areas?

Alderman Clemons

Both.

Attorney William Dolan

In terms of my experience with housing/housing development as the Mayor mentioned, I have a Master's in BA from Suffolk. Part of my concentration was doing very nerdy projects on things like high speed rail development in Brazil, particularly a project to connect Rio Sao Paulo Campinas when they were holding the World Cup and the Olympics within a very short period of time. So I am, I would say very familiar in terms of bang-for-your-buck public development in stimulating the economy with being selective about how you develop a community.

Alderman Clemons

Okay. Thank you.

Chairwoman Kelly

Alderman Klee?

Alderman Klee

Thank you, Madam President. Just a quick question Attorney Dolan or Representative Dolan - I don't know which one to call you. Is your practice here in Nashua or?

Attorney William Dolan

I have two locations. I have one in Lowell, MA, and other in Nashua.

Alderman Klee

Okay, great. May I ask a quick follow up?

If I remember correctly I think when we set up the Housing Trust Fund, we had hoped to have a local lawyer but I don't think we made it mandatory so I'm glad to see that you are here. You will be familiar with the community. I think that's really important. That was one of the things. I remember having that that discussion and for some reason blanking as to what we finally came out with. I don't think we want to tie our hands to it but it was important to have someone local. So thank you for stepping up and actually I think having you up in the State House might be a little bit of an edge too so thank you.

Chairwoman Kelly

Alderman Thibeault?

Alderman Thibeault

Thank you, Madam Chairwoman. So Attorney Dolan, Representative Dolan I just want to thank you for coming forward. It's not easy to sit on these City committees. We want to get the best and it's good to see that - I looked at your resume and it's very strong. I appreciate you stepping forward because it's not an easy task and people will hold you accountable as we will as well but the City will too. Thank you so much for stepping up.

Attorney William Dolan

Thank you.

Chairwoman Kelly

Alderman Moran?

Alderman Moran

Thank you, Madam Chairwoman. My understanding is that you practice criminal law. In your experience working with people that you defend, I believe you also work with families as well. Have you ever had to deal with one of your clients who are risk of losing their housing, or had limited access to housing, or if it was a probate/family matter where children were at risk. Did you help those families navigate those very delicate issues?

Attorney William Dolan

So I would say that based on the type of law I practice, many of the people, especially if they're held in custody, they don't have money to pay rent because they're living in Valley Street for a period of time. They are of course become housing insecure. I have helped at various time navigate the system. There is legal aid organizations in New Hampshire that I have connected to. There was an opportunity where I actually when I had a juvenile client who was getting evicted and did step in to help as much as I can particularly because it seemed like the eviction was based on some of his behaviors that were a manifestation of a disability which otherwise if no one would have advocated for that specific area of law, he may have lost his house but he didn't.

Alderman Moran

Thank you.

Chairwoman Kelly

Just give me one second guys. I have a question. You're all set Alderman Moran. Okay.

Attorney Dolan thank you for coming forward as Alderman Thibeault was pointing out. These are very interesting committees but we know they take a lot of your time. My question was around my thinking on this Committee is that there is going to be a lot of contract work. So I was wondering around your experience with contracts and going through that because that is what my thought was the lawyer part of this would be.

Attorney William Dolan

So along the lines of my education as part of the MBA and part of the JD, I've had various experience giving public/private partnerships BPE agreements, particular how to structure them. I've always generally been on a different side of the municipality more on the corporate side of it but have an understanding of how to structure BPE so that it creates value for who your client is. I think generally, too, there is a school of thought in terms of creating joint value I think with more in terms of shareholder but community value. What can both sides bring to the table to create value for both sides? I think that's the type of thing I would look forward to in terms of any type of contracts or BPE in this situation.

Chairwoman Kelly

Great. I also have a follow-up. I think you've recently moved to Nashua, is that true?

Attorney William Dolan

Three years ago.

Chairwoman Kelly

And as overall as someone who was and you said you worked and lived in housing projects in Nashua now, what's your kind of hope and dream for this Committee to do in the next couple of years?

Attorney William Dolan

That is a very poignant and thoughtful question. I want to leave that Committee and leave Nashua in a better way than I found it. I think that it is not a dictatorship. I don't get to make decisions on my own but I hope to bring that voice that is unique and leave the Committee and leave Nashua a better place at the end of my term.

Chairwoman Kelly

Great. Other questions from the Committee? Alderman Lopez and then Alderman Moran?

Alderman Lopez

Yeah with regards to – so I noticed that you have volunteer experience in East Boston. I think Boston is an example and the surrounding communities where middle and lower income families come from more diverse backgrounds don't necessarily have the same opportunities or access to housing that a lot of kids in the past have enjoyed here in New Hampshire in a more rural and non-developing urban experience. So do you think your experience working with kids and seeing what families go through is likely to help you have insight into how we can develop as a City so that we maintain that status that we have of being something of a very small city but a large town and there is still that community of welcoming. There is still that people from different places still have access to different amenities that can be shared. Do you think your experience in that particular area might lend some insight?

Attorney William Dolan

So I think maybe not relying on the experience of East Boston. I don't want to disparage our colleagues in other States, other cities, other municipalities. I think that in general, the term "gentrification" is a dirty word because it by its nature pushes out usually the lower income people say perhaps maybe East Boston where the kids that I worked with that were predominantly Central American kids were pushed out to have people that came from other areas of

Boston who wanted, you know, Maverick Square for instance. A know it's a 5 minute train ride from downtown Boston. So there seemed to be in terms of developing this in East Boston, there was sort of a push for lower income, more brown kids were pushed out of that neighborhood and I don't want to see that repeated in Nashua.

Alderman Lopez

I appreciate the answers especially because the downtown adjacent neighborhoods have a very strong presentation of Central American culture and have always been a place where immigrants and people from other places have come to kind of start their livelihood, start families, get involved in Nashua, kind of see what things are about. I think it's important that we remember that is an essential part of what makes downtown as vibrant as it is today, as vibrant as it has always been is the people more than the props, and the fixtures, and that type of thing. Thank you.

Chairwoman Kelly

All set Alderman Lopez? Alderman Moran?

Alderman Lopez

Yes.

Alderman Moran

Thank you, Madam Chairwoman. Maybe more of a statement than a question or how you would handle it. So the affordable housing as described is 80% of the median income for a family of four. I know I'm a sorter of low to moderate income. Low – you're going to have to go to Section 8 essentially - private owners. What would you do to help forge away for that 60% median income of a family of four to establish or not be pushed out by gentrification here in Nashua?

Attorney William Dolan

So just to clarify your question. So what I think what you're essentially seemingly what you're asking me is sort of this push and pull between economic development, gentrification, maintaining the flare of the neighborhood that is currently there. I think that there is certainly, like I said, a push and pull between economic development, best bang for your buck, affordable housing. The situations are complex and that's why I think we need a committee to handle these things.

Alderman Moran

That was a very political answer. Thank you.

Chairwoman Kelly

Are you all set Alderman Moran?

Alderman Moran

Yes, thank you.

Chairwoman Kelly

Any other questions from the Committee? Alderman Clemons?

Alderman Clemons

Not a question but I am very impressed with the conversation here this evening. I think you'll serve the Committee very well. I am enthusiastically supporting you.

Attorney William Dolan

Thank you very much.

Chairwoman Kelly

All set. Alright thank you. We will take up your nomination later in the meeting.

Board of Assessors

Abdallah "Jay" Minkarah (new appointment)  
13 Mount Pleasant Street  
Nashua, NH 03064

Indefinite Term at the pleasure of the Mayor

**\*\*absent from interview – rescheduled to February 6, 2023\*\***

Ethics Review Committee

Timothy E. Bush (new appointment)  
378 Main Street  
Nashua, NH 03060

Term to Expire: January 1, 2026

Chairwoman Kelly

Thank you for joining us Mr. Bush. Mayor?

Mayor Donchess

Thank you, Madam Chair. So the Ethics Review Committee is a Committee that's created by Nashua Ordinances specifically to review complaints directed to the Nashua Board of Ethics. There is a Code of Ethics within the Ordinances. If there is a complaint made that alleges a violation of one of more specific provisions of the Nashua Code of Ethics as I'm calling it, then the Ethics Review Committee reviews the complaint and takes whatever action might be appropriate. This doesn't allege violation of the Code. It alleges a violation so we're going to hold a hearing or take some evidence.

The Committee has lapsed for a number of years because there haven't been any ethics complaints. Typically what the City has done is reconstitute the Committee if complaints come in or if expected complaints are on the horizon. I believe at least one or more Aldermen have raised the issue of should we reconstitute the Committee, which I agree is a good idea. Tim Bush is my first appointment to this Committee. Now Tim is very well qualified to be on the Ethics Review Committee. Of course, he is a practicing attorney in Nashua having grown up in the City. He went to BC as an undergraduate and to Suffolk Law School. He previously served on the Ethics Review Committee. If the Ethics Review Committee were like other committees where the provisions of law generally say that a person serves in a hold over status until a replacement is appointed and confirmed. If that were the case here, Attorney Bush would still be on the Committee but because there hadn't been any hearings for some years, no complaints, this legislation says the terms lapse and you have to reappoint people.

So Tim has previously been on the Committee. He's previously served as Chair of the Committee. In addition, Attorney Bush has served for about two years on the Advisory Committee on judicial ethics at the State level. That is a committee that is appointed by the NH Supreme Court to advise judges regarding questions of ethics and any other matters that come before the committee. So he's very experienced both here at the City level and at the State level in considering codes of ethics and related issues. So I'm very pleased to be able to appoint Tim Bush as the first of a number of members on the Ethics Review Committee. I'll ask Tim to tell you a little about himself to the extent you're not familiar already and of his interest in rejoining the Committee.

Attorney Timothy Bush

Thank you, Mayor Donchess. Thanks everyone. Just a couple of things. I appreciate the Mayor talking about my kind of post graduate education but frankly, I think my most valuable education came here in the City of Nashua. I was the first class to go through Birch Hill Elementary School which dates me pretty significantly. I won't give you the exact year but I got out of Nashua High in 1984. So I've been here my whole life. I did, not to be controversial, but I did leave north Nashua. I grew up by the airport to move to south Nashua and I've taken some heat from that from some of my longtime friends.

As Mayor Donchess said, I did serve on this Committee a number of years ago. I was actually surprised at how many years ago it was it seems like it's flown by. I would just tell the Aldermen based on my experience what you

already know. It's a very limited Committee in terms of its jurisdiction I think if you look at it. We did have a hearing. I don't know what liberty I obviously can't get into the complainant's as to who was there and what the issue was about but, you know, it was very interesting. I remember Mike Tobacsko was on the Committee, and Jack Kelly, and we were advised by City Counsel, and Mrs. Weeks was on the Committee. I found it to be a fairly positive experience. Those of us who've been around a long time know that in the 80's early 90's there were some problems with the Board of Aldermen. There are sometimes issues that come up with City employees. Usually you would be covered by either a criminal statute, or civil statute, or something other than the particular auspice of this Committee. At least from my prior dealing on the Committee, I was very pleased with the people I was serving with. I thought they had everyone's best interest at heart and I thought we conducted a fair hearing and rendered a fair decision.

Chairwoman Kelly

Great. Questions from the Committee. Alderman Thibeault?

Alderman Thibeault

Thank you, Madam Chairwoman. So again, Mr. Bush/Attorney Bush thank you for coming and stepping up. This is one of those Committees that's probably somewhat controversial a little bit. Like you said and Mayor Donchess said, it's very different than other committees. You don't meet regularly unless something is going on, right? I'm glad to hear you've done it before. You said you only heard one case last time you were on the Ethics Committee?

Attorney Timothy Bush

That's correct. There was another case. That's correct.

Alderman Thibeault

So I'm going through a hypothetical and it's not something I think but I want to make sure that it's clear out there how you think about this. So my first part of this two-part question is would you say that you're close to any of the Aldermen that are on the aldermanic Board today?

Attorney Timothy Bush

I'm sure I'd like all the Aldermen but no I don't think I know any in particular. I know Ernie Jette. I know Ernie.

Alderman Thibeault

So if someone you're close to comes before the Ethics Board as someone that's got the complaint against them, how would you be able to handle that if it came in front of you?

Attorney Timothy Bush

Well I think there are actually some guidelines if you look at the Ethics rules, maybe under the hearing. If you look at the composition of the Board, Rules of Procedure 12-31, I think it's B7. I think if there's any issue with respect to - I always err on the side of caution when it comes to ethics. That may be why the Supreme Court had put me on the Advisory Board. There's three judges and two lawyers in that committee. That's it. Two private lawyers. If there was a complaint against Ernie Jette for example, not that there every would be because we all know Ernie, I wouldn't sit on it. I haven't talked to Ernie probably in two or three years because I haven't seen him at a Nashua Bar meeting or anything. Just the mere fact that I know him a little bit, I probably wouldn't serve on that.

Alderman Thibeault

Okay. We'll keep him out of trouble. Thank you.

Attorney Timothy Bush

There you go.

Chairwoman Kelly

Just as a follow up to that, the exact wording says, "No member of the Committee whose participation would be a conflict of interest shall participate in the hearing except when called as a witness." So we can put that on the record but it's very clear as to how that should work. Alderman Lopez?

Alderman Lopez

So first of all, I could not see Aldermen Jette getting into an ethics dispute.

Unidentified Male Speaker

I agree with that.

Alderman Lopez

I'm keeping my eyes on shifty Clemons over here.

When I was looking at your resume, I had it in mind because I had noticed that you'd been on the committee before, I had it in mind to ask you what we should ask you about the committee since you've had practical experience with it and more experience than the members that will be interviewing for it. Instead, I would just commend you on your history of professional accomplishment. Thank you for willing to serve and recognize that you are very familiar with being in a position of public trust and it seems like you're very effective in that roll. I think our Ethics Committee will much be benefitted from your presence on it. So thank you very much.

Attorney Timothy Bush

I appreciate that. Thank you.

Chairwoman Kelly

Other questions? Alderman Clemons?

Alderman Clemons

Thank you. I remember when you were on the Ethics Committee from back then and you did an admiral job. Thank you for all of your service. Thank you for stepping forward and I will definitely support you.

Attorney Timothy Bush

Thank you, Alderman Clemons. I appreciate that.

Chairwoman Kelly

Alderman Moran?

Alderman Moran

Thank you, Madam Chairwoman. Would you say there's a conflict - let's say you're an attorney obviously and there's a complaint against Attorney Bolton. Just because you guys are attorneys, would you stick together with a fellow attorney?

Attorney Timothy Bush

I would say this. I would think we would if there was a complaint against let's say Attorney Bolton, we would probably have a larger issue to be candid with you. The issue would be if you look at the Ethics Review Committee and all of their rules and if you look at Chapter 5, replete throughout these rules are indications that the City counsel would have to - advises the Board as to what to do. I think if there was a complaint against Attorney Bolton, one of the first things the Committee would have to do would be to make a decision whether or not we would have to have separate counsel. City of Concord, City of Manchester - somebody from one of those places to sit on that hearing because, you know, I'm more familiar with Celia Leonard who has worked with as a liaison with the Committee before. I would also probably have them take it up. They're both lawyers and they certainly wouldn't want to - I wouldn't think would want to be part of any type of conflict of interest if there was a complaint against them.



Mayor Donchess

Yes. I've thought about that question. I think we would need outside counsel to advise the Committee in that hypothetical circumstance.

Alderman Moran

And I think that's a very reasonable stance to take to avoid any type of bad perception I guess and be harsh with my words.

Attorney Timothy Bush

I think that's right Alderman Moran. I clerked one of my most difficult years was as a law clerk. I served under a US Magistrate Judge named William Barry. He was William Barry, Jr., actually who was the father of William Barry, III, who some of you may know. Nashua guy. He always gave everyone a fair hearing no matter what. Even if they didn't - we dealt with a lot of pro se litigants from the prison and even if they didn't technically do everything that had to do or didn't technically meet the requirements in some type of oral argument setting, he would always err on the side of giving them a fair hearing.

Here when you have a complainant, this is a community that represents the City of Nashua. You want to make sure that any litigant before or potential litigant they may not like the ultimate decision but you want them to at least come away and say hey look I had a fair hearing. One of the ways to do that is when there's ever a - even a potential conflict of interest. Even if it doesn't technically violate an ethical rule, you don't really skate that line. You just say look let's just do this in a way that's fair for everyone. You don't want to draw yourself an ethical complaint if you're a lawyer for being involved in something that's close to call.

Chairwoman Kelly

All set. Alderman Moran?

Alderman Moran

Thank you. That's a great answer and that's been my experience with attorneys as always erring on the side of caution. I will say I hope you are prepared that this is going to be a lot busier than probably your last stint. I foresee many, mostly frivolous, that's just the way it's going to be. I thank you so much for knowing that coming in and being prepared to sit on the Committee. I'm of course, I'm sure you aren't saying in your head they're frivolous but that there's going to be a lot.

Second are you a BC Eagles fan?

Attorney Timothy Bush

I am. I used to be before the ACC.

Alderman Moran

A terror, someone to BU. Sorry to hear that.

Attorney Timothy Bush

Well you'll be happy to know that my oldest daughter went to BU in spite of growing up in a BC household so.

Alderman Moran

Great.

Chairwoman Kelly

I understand. I went to BU.

Mayor Donchess

Well we should have a hockey game then.

Chairwoman Kelly

Are there other questions from the Committee? Great. I don't have any questions. You answered all of the ones that I had listed. I appreciate your willingness to serve on this Committee and I look forward to learning more about you and obviously I'm sure you'll do great work like you've in the past. So thank you.

Attorney Timothy Bush

Thank you.

Mayor Donchess

All right. Thank you, Madam Chair. I'll be back next time with Mr. Minkarah who hopefully can come in February.

Chairwoman Kelly

Before you go, are you going to also be coming back with a few more Ethics Review? How many people has to be on that Committee?

Mayor Donchess

Yes. It is a five member Committee. So yes, we've got other people in the works.

Chairwoman Kelly

Okay, great. Thank you Mayor. Happy New Year.

APPLICATION TO LICENSE HAWKER'S, PEDDLER'S, ITINERANT VENDOR'S LICENSE - None

APPOINTMENTS BY THE MAYOR

**MOTION BY ALDERMAN THIBEAULT TO RECOMMEND THE FOLLOWING NEW APPOINTMENT TO THE HOUSING TRUST FUND COMMITTEE: WILLIAM DOLAN WITH A TERM TO EXPIRE JANUARY 1, 2026; TO RECOMMEND THE FOLLOWING NEW APPOINTMENT TO THE ETHICS REVIEW COMMITTEE: TIMOTHY E. BUSH WITH A TERM TO EXPIRE JANUARY 1, 2026**  
**MOTION CARRIED**

UNFINISHED BUSINESS – None

NEW BUSINESS – RESOLUTIONS - None

NEW BUSINESS – ORDINANCES

**O-22-039**

Endorsers: Alderman Patricia Klee  
Alderman-at-Large Ben Clemons  
Alderman Derek Thibeault  
Alderman-at-Large Melbourne Moran, Jr.  
Alderman Thomas Lopez  
Alderman Alex Comeau  
Alderman June M. Caron  
Alderman-at-Large Lori Wilshire

**AMENDING THE TAX EXEMPTION FOR ELDERLY PERSONS BY INCREASING THE MAXIMUM ALLOWED INDIVIDUAL AND COMBINED NET INCOME AND ASSET AMOUNTS**

**MOTION BY ALDERMAN THIBEAULT TO RECOMMEND FINAL PASSAGE**

ON THE QUESTION

Chairwoman Kelly

Motion is to recommend final passage. Discussion? Alderman Klee?

Alderman Klee

Thank you so much Madam Chairwoman. This is something that I brought forward to the Board. As you can see, we have a number of my colleagues here who have also brought this forward too. This was just what I would the finishing touches of the original change that we made to the Elderly Tax Credit. We did half the job when we brought the credit dollars up. We did not bring up the income or the values of the assets. When I was going through this, I originally brought it up was because I had a constituent who asked me a question and said I've got one of the largest social security raises ever and I think this is gonna slowly push me over the edge in income level. They were correct. It's 8% or thereabouts.

So I went to Mr. Griffin and I asked him. I said do you think raising the income level 8% would be good because we were looking at cost of living and inflation but inflation changes so much. We wanted something that was really consistent. The federal government came up with the 8% for the social security and more or less for federal employees as well depending upon what kind of group you fell into. So we agreed that this 8% was the right one. So looking at the assets again, do you go with inflation, do you go with cost of living? How do you handle that? We really felt that doing an 8% increase - it's not a major jump. I heard some people who said we should bring it up much higher and so on. I think that we need to do baby steps. I think the 8% is a good start. Maybe in the year we'd have to change, I don't know but I think this is a good start.

One of the questions I think was asked was when Alderman Moran had brought the same 8% up for the disabled and so on was why do we keep married and single together? We put it all in one grouping and the reason why we do that is if something were to happen to one of them that would drastically change. We didn't want that to happen so we keep it as a one person or two. If someone were to pass suddenly, that person goes into a single and not as a married couple. Therefore, they could lose their elderly if we were to have like a \$35,000 and a \$50,000 which some communities do this. I think the previous Board and Alderman Clemons may remember this, I don't know. I tried finding it and I could not find it. But a previous Board has decided it was better to do it as a two rather than a one and a two because if you do that if something happens to the other person, you have to reduce their income eligibility. I think 8% was a good number to put our hat on and it helps finish the job that we started with raising the elderly tax exemption.

Chairwoman Kelly

All set Alderman Klee? Alderman Clemons?

Alderman Clemons

Thank you. Yes I co-endorsed this as well because I, and in particular the 8%, because my concern who were folks who are on a fixed income particularly where their only source of income is social security. So if that's your only source of income and all of a sudden it jumped 8% but we didn't change this amount, then you could find yourself not getting this and all of a sudden owing some money. So to me, that was a good number to use based on what I feel is probably our most vulnerable population of seniors. And then of course, 8% if you have another source of income or whatever is also, I think, a pretty good barometer to use for that.

In regards to when they came up with that, I don't know. It was probably before my time but I think it's a good policy to keep the married and the single the same. So I certainly support that. Thank you.

Chairwoman Kelly

Alderman Thibeault?

Alderman Thibeault

Thank you, Madam Chairwoman. Really the only real shame in this is not being able to have had some foresight and predict the future to be able to catch everybody at the end of the year instead of this for next year because it was hard to see. We had an elderly man come in here and show us that he had zero last year and now all of a sudden he has a \$1,200 tax bill. You can't always foresee that stuff coming but it was unfortunate to see him. There's probably I'm sure many other people that got kind of cut off by this.

To Alderman Klee's point, we are now finishing the job so that we don't leave people behind. I think it's important that we at least get those people that were there last year and then hopefully maybe in the future we look at it a different way, or we're able to bump it up more, or whatnot in the future. Like you said, baby steps for that. I co-endorsed this as well and I full heartedly support this.

Chairwoman Kelly

Great. Any other - Alderman Lopez?

Alderman Lopez

Yeah I think this is important to keep in mind that economic gentrification can come in a lot of different way. Where we have a steadily growing tax structure due to a lot of passed down expenses that might be coming from the State that we don't necessarily have control over, it can be tempting to look at how we can cut amenities that a lot of special populations are very much in need of such as transportation, such as size of schools. Even law enforcement in inner city neighborhoods where there's a lot more people to interact with each other, so you need a solid police force. If you look at just the price tag that comes per tax payer, then it can be a burden on people who generate less revenue and own property in the City and that can discourage them from being able to stay in the City.

But likewise, reducing the services that have made Nashua consistently top five, three, whatever on difference scoring charts and are part of the culture that people have grown up with and enjoyed here is also a way of pushing out people with particular need for access to those services. We can't just cut the budget because even though elderly people who grew up here are struggling to maintain their affordability, they probably need to use the bus system. They probably need paratransit and these are things that cost money and particularly, we're learning in the case of paratransit and public transportation are underfunded to the point where they can't find people to do it. So it is important that we find a middle ground between removing amenities that are necessary as a function of a City with a population with diverse needs and maintaining affordability. I think this exemptions are an essential part of it. Recognizing that some populations contribute in other ways whether they're veterans, whether they're disabled, or whether they're elderly, Nashua is better for having these people as its residents, as its neighbors. So I look forward to voting in favor of this tonight and again in the Board of Aldermen.

Chairwoman Kelly

Alderman Klee?

Alderman Klee

Thank you, Madam Chairwoman. I wanted to just in some regards I apologize because it may seem like minutia but I wanted to clarify that the assets do not include the residence that the person lives in and they can only get an exemption for the residence that they live in here in Nashua. However if a person has temporarily been removed from that residence - for instance if they had to go to rehabilitation, or a nursing home for a temporary period of time, they don't lose it. I want to make sure that's very clear that if a person has to be rehabilitated or even if lasts a year or even more, they're not going to lose it. I don't want people to think oh we give to them and then we take it away when they turn their back to it. As well as if the person has what we call an "ADU", an accessory dwelling unit. It used to be called like a mother-in-law apartment. As long as they live in one part of that residence, even if it's the tiniest part of it, it doesn't have to be the larger home, they still get the full exemption for the property.

So I just want to clarify that because I have had people who called me and said oh I don't qualify because my house is worth more than the \$162,000. Your house doesn't qualify for that. It's exempted from your assets. Just to push the envelope, you could own a million dollar home, not have a mortgage, and it's not part of your asset but that's because no one is going to force you to sell it to pay the taxes for it. That would be absolutely ridiculous and we would never do that. Thank you.

Chairwoman Kelly

All set? All those in favor?

**MOTION CARRIED**

TABLED IN COMMITTEE

**O-22-028**

Endorsers: Alderman Derek Thibeault  
Alderman-at-Large Michael B. O'Brien, Sr.  
Alderman-at-Large Melbourne Moran, Jr.  
Alderman Thomas Lopez  
Alderman-at-Large Ben Clemons  
Alderman-at-Large Gloria Timmons

**REQUIRING NONPUBLIC SESSIONS TO BE ENTIRELY IN-PERSON**

- Tabled at 12/5/22 meeting

**O-22-031**

Endorsers: Alderman Derek Thibeault  
Alderman-at-Large Melbourne Moran, Jr.  
Alderman-at-Large Ben Clemons  
Alderman Alex Comeau  
Alderman Tyler Gouveia  
Alderman June M. Caron  
Alderman-at-Large Gloria Timmons  
Alderman-at-Large Shoshanna Kelly

**INCREASING THE VETERANS' OPTIONAL AND ALL VETERANS' TAX CREDITS**

- Tabled at 11/1/2022 meeting – review at first Personnel meeting in April 2023

PUBLIC COMMENT - None

GENERAL DISCUSSION - None

REMARKS BY THE ALDERMEN

Alderman Klee

I just wanted to make an announcement that the Finance Committee meeting tomorrow will start at 7:30 not at 7:00. Just for the general public and those members that are on it. It's going to be at 7:30.

Chairwoman Kelly

Great. Any other remarks? Do I have a Motion?

ADJOURNMENT

**MOTION BY ALDERMAN LOPEZ TO ADJOURN  
MOTION CARRIED**

The meeting was declared closed at 7:44 p.m.

Alderman Thomas Lopez  
Committee Clerk